

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR
THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
SAN ANTONIO DIVISION

HOLCOMBE, et. al,

Plaintiffs

vs.

UNITED STATES OF
AMERICA,

Defendant

NO. 5:18-CV-00555-XR

(consolidated cases)

**PLAINTIFFS' REPLY & SUPPLEMENTAL
BRIEF ON SETTLEMENT**

Today, the Government issued a press release announcing the settlement of the Emanuel Charleston Church mass-shooting case. That case presents nearly identical legal arguments to this case, alleging that the Government's negligent failure to administer the NICS system led to a prohibited person obtaining a firearm that was later used to commit a mass shooting in a church.

The Government's take on the Emanuel Charleston Church mass-shooting case is telling. It stated, "[f]or those killed in the shooting, the settlements range from \$6 million to \$7.5 million per claimant. For the survivors, the settlements are for \$5 million per claimant."¹ The Charleston settlement

¹ Dep't of Justice, Office of Public Affairs (Oct. 28, 2021), *available at* <https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/justice-department-announces-multi-million-dollar-civil-settlement-principle-mother-emanuel>

involves 14 plaintiffs (nine deaths and five persons who were either injured or witnessed the shooting). *Id.* The Government settled all 14 claims for \$88 million.²

Unlike this case, the South Carolina case had *no* finding of liability against the Government, *nor any finding* of proportionate responsibility against the shooter. *See generally Sanders v. United States*, No. 2:16-cv-02356 (D.S.C. 2021) (emphasis added).

CONCLUSION

While the Plaintiffs disagree with the factually inaccurate arguments made in the Government's response, Plaintiffs offer this supplemental brief on newly developing information that supports its position in Plaintiffs' motion for mediation. Plaintiffs further request that the Court make note of this analogous situation.

Plaintiffs remain hopeful that the Government will change their position in this case and engage in meaningful settlement negotiations and—as expressed to Magistrate Judge Chestney—will be available at any moment to have those negotiations.

² Pete Williams, Justice Department reaches settlement with families of 2015 Charleston church massacre (Oct. 28, 2021), *available at* <https://www.nbcnews.com/politics/justice-department/families-charleston-church-shooting-settle-lawsuit-justice-department-n1282635>

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ Jamal K. Alsaffar

Jamal K. Alsaffar

JAlsaffar@nationaltriallaw.com

Texas Bar No. 24027193

Tom Jacob

TJacob@nationaltriallaw.com

Texas Bar No. 24069981

**Whitehurst, Harkness, Brees, Cheng,
Alsaffar & Higginbotham & Jacob
PLLC**

7500 Rialto Blvd, Bldg. Two, Ste 250

Austin, TX 78735

Office 512-476-4346

Fax 512-476-4400

Counsel for Vidal, McKenzie, Solis,
McNulty, and Wall

/s/ Jason P. Steed

Jason P. Steed

JSteed@kilpatricktownsend.com

Texas Bar No. 24070671

**Kilpatrick Townsend & Stockton
LLP**

2001 Ross Avenue, Suite 4400

Dallas, TX 75201

Office 214-922-7112

Fax 214-853-5731

Counsel for Vidal, McNulty, and Wall

/s/ April A. Strahan

April A. Strahan

april@ammonslaw.com

Texas Bar No. 24056387

Robert E. Ammons

rob@ammonslaw.com

Texas Bar No. 01159820

The Ammons Law Firm

3700 Montrose Blvd.

Houston, TX 77006

Office 866-523-1603

Fax 713-523-4159

Counsel for Holcombe, Ramsey, Curnow
& Macias

/s/ Daniel J.T. Sciano

Daniel J.T. Sciano

DSciano@tsslawyers.com

Texas Bar No. 17881200

Tinsman & Sciano

10107 McAllister Freeway

San Antonio, TX 78216

Office 210-225-3121

Fax 210-225-6235

Counsel for Amador

/s/ Daniel Barks

Daniel D. Barks, *pro hac vice*

ddb@speiserkrause.com

Speiser Krause, P.C.

5555 Glenridge Connector, Suite 550

Atlanta, GA 30342

Office 571-814-3344

Fax 866-936-6382

Counsel for Holcombe

/s/ Mark Collmer

Mark W. Collmer

drcollmer@aol.com

Texas Bar No. 04626420

Collmer Law Firm

3700 Montrose

Houston, TX 77006

Office 713-337-4040

Counsel for Holcombe

/s/ Dennis Peery

Dennis Charles Peery

d.peery@tylerpeery.com

Texas Bar No. 15728750

R. Craig Bettis

cbettis@tylerpeery.com

Texas Bar No. 24040518

Tyler & Peery

5822 West IH 10

San Antonio, TX 78201

Office 210-774-6445

Counsel for Uhl

/s/ Tim Maloney

Tim Maloney

Texas Bar No. 12887380

timmaloney@yahoo.com

Paul E. Campolo

pcampolo@maloneyandcampolo.com

Texas Bar No. 03730150

Maloney & Campolo, L.L.P.

926 S. Alamo

San Antonio, TX 78205

Office (210) 465-1523

Counsel for Ramsey

/s/ George LeGrand

George LeGrand

tegrande@aol.com

Texas Bar No. 12171450

Stanley Bernstein

Texas Bar No. 02225400

LeGrand & Bernstein

2511 N. Saint Mary's St.

San Antonio, Texas 78212

Office 210-733-9439

Fax 510-735-3542

Counsel for Wall & Solis

/s/ Joseph M. Schreiber

Joseph M. Schreiber

joe@lawdoneright.net

Texas Bar No. 24037449

Erik A. Knockaert

erik@lawdoneright.net

Texas Bar No. 24036921

Schreiber | Knockaert, PLLC

701 N. Post Oak Rd., Suite 325

Houston, TX 77024

Phone (281) 949-8904

Fax (281) 949-8914

Counsel for Brown

/s/ Justin Demerath

Justin Demerath

jdemerath@808west.com

Texas Bar No. 24034415

O'Hanlon, McCollom & Demerath

808 West Ave.

Austin, TX 78701

Office 512-494-9949

Counsel for Corrigan, Braden,
Warden, Stevens, Pachal, McCain, &
Poston

/s/ Jason Webster

Jason Webster

jwebster@thewebsterlawfirm.com

Texas Bar No. 24033318

The Webster Law Firm

6200 Savoy

Suite 640

Houston, TX 77036

Counsel for Lookingbill

/s/ Brett Reynolds

Brett T. Reynolds

btreynolds@btrlaw.com

Texas Bar No. 16795500

Brett Reynolds & Associates, P.C.

1250 N.E. Loop 420, Suite 420

San Antonio, TX 78219

(210)805-9799

Counsel for Workman, Colblath, and
Harris

/s/ Marion M. Reilly

Marion M. Reilly

Hilliard Munoz Gonzales, L.L.P.

719 S. Shoreline - Ste 500

Corpus Christi, TX 78401

(361) 882-1612

361/882-3015 (fax)

marion@hmglawfirm.com

Counsel for McMahan

/s/ Hugh Plummer

Hugh Plummer

Law Office of Thomas J. Henry

4715 Fredricksburg

San Antonio, TX 78229

(210) 585-2151

(361) 985-0601 (fax)

hplummer@tjhlaw.com

Counsel for McMahan

/s/ Kelley W. Kelley

Kelley W. Kelley

Anderson & Associates Law Firm

2600 SW Military Drive, Suite 118

San Antonio, TX 78224

(210) 928-9999

(210) 928-9118 (fax)

kk.aalaw@yahoo.com

Counsel for Ward

/s/ Craig Carlson

Craig Carlson

ccarlson@carlsonattorneys.com

Philip Koelsch

pkoelsch@carlsonattorneys.com

Joe Craven

jcraven@carlsonattorneys.com

The Carlson Law Firm

100 E Central Texas Expy

Killeen, TX 76541

254-526-5688

Counsel for Rios

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

By our signatures above, we certify that a copy of Plaintiffs' Reply & Supplemental Brief on Settlement has been sent to the following on October 28, 2021 via the Court's CM/ECF notice system.

Paul D. Stern
Daniel P. Chung
Austin L. Furman
Stephen E. Handler
Jocelyn Krieger
James G. Touhey, Jr.
U.S. Department of Justice

Clayton R. Diedrichs
James F. Gilligan
James Edward Dingivan
U.S. Attorney's Office
Western District of Texas